

No. 12/Review-MTNL/2014/SSW-I

National Commission for Scheduled Castes

**Minutes of the Review Meeting under taken by the National Commission for Scheduled Castes on 09.02.2015 to assess and monitor of implementation of reservation policy for SC in Mahanagar Telephone Nigam Limited, New Delhi.**

A list of participants in the meeting is at Annexure A.

The National Commission for SCs first held a meeting with office bearers of the MTNL SC/ST Employees Welfare Association. Both the Associations welcomed the Commission and thereafter raised following issues/points:-

1. 85<sup>th</sup> amendment Act is not being implemented in MTNL.
2. The representatives of Union are involved in the policy matters where as representatives of SC/ST Associations are deprived.
3. Periodical meetings should be taken by the Liaison Officer. He is not competent for taking decision.
4. No provision of promotion from NE-11 to E-2 for operator cadre.
5. No reservation in NEPP-Financial upgradation.
6. There is no facilities for SC/ST Associations, only one room has been provided in Badli Telephone Exchange.
7. Only Rs. 60,000/- was given by the management after demand of Rs. 300,000/- for celebration of Birth Anniversary of Baba Sahib Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar.

**Meeting with the Management**

The Director (HR), MTNL welcomed Dr. P.L. Punia, Chairman along with Dr. Raj Kumar Verka, Vice-Chairman, Shri Raju Parmar, Member, Sh. Ishwar Singh, Member, Smt. P.M. Kamalamma, Member, Dr. Vinod Aggarwal, Secretary and Dr. Smita S. Chaudhri, Joint Secretary and other Officers of NCSC. Thereafter CMD, MTNL gave a brief description about the working of MTNL in which he stressed that 98% of employees are the legacy staff from Department of Telecom after they have taken permanent absorption in MTNL in November 1998 and October 2000 as per their option. Thereafter, it was mentioned by Dir (HR) that all provisions related to SC,ST & OBC employees are being followed as per Govt. rules.

At the out set the Chairman, NCSC introduced his colleagues. In his welcome address, he apprised the MTNL about the constitutional mandate of the Commission and the need for this review meeting. He informed MTNL management that there are two Associations in MTNL both the Associations raised the issues related to the welfare of scheduled caste employees in MTNL. It would be better for the welfare of scheduled caste employee if these two associations may be combined in one.

The issues of the SC/ST Employees Welfare Association were raised one by one and explained to management CMD informed that non-implementation of 85<sup>th</sup> Amendment Act

and related cases of Shri Achchhey Lal, Ganga Saran, Ram Singh etc., for which a meeting was held in the chamber of Hon'ble Vice Chairman, NCSC some time back. He assured for quick action in the matter. Further, he has sought two months time from Commission because as per judgment of Hon'ble Supreme Court, the seniority of TES Group B officers is to be re-casted in consultation with Deptt. of Telecom. In all Units, the Liaison officers are nominated at the level of DGM & above and necessary instructions have been issued to hold regular meetings with SC/ST Associations for redressal of their grievances. Instructions for holding quarterly meeting by Liaison officer will be re-issued. There is no promotional avenue for Telecom Operators in Non-Technical Identified post of E-2, scale which is to be filled from employees working in NE-11 scale. There is a promotional avenue for Telecom Operators through competitive examination for the post of JTO which is E-2 level post where as non technical identified post are meant for the non technical i.e., clerks and ministerial staff. Suitable office accommodation to the association will be tried to provide nearby. Further CMD informed the Commission that due to poor financial position of Company, MTNL has withdrawn various perks and allowances of employees and various cost cutting steps are introduced to reduce losses. However, it will be tried to increase some suitable amount at that time for celebration of Birth Anniversary of Baba Sahib Dr. B.R. Ambedkar. Thereafter, the replies given by the MTNL management on the questionnaire of the NCSC were discussed.

The Chairman NCSC brought to the notice of the CMD, MTNL that 30 cases of SC employees of MTNL are pending in the Commission. He advised the CMD that a date of convenient to the Vice-Chairman, NCSC may be taken to hear these cases at the same time. So that speedy disposal of the cases may be taken place. The CMD informed that only 12 cases are pending. He assured the Commission that all efforts will be made to settle these cases on priority.

Hon'ble Member (RP) pointed out that MTNL has not made any recruitment from the year 2012 to 2014. He further pointed out that there is no reservation in promotion. In this regard, CMD informed that all promotions are based on seniority cum-fitness and for Executive level posts there is time bound financial up-gradation policy. Which also provides relaxation in Bench Mark Grading for SCs. The Secretary, NCSC advised the MTNL that as per the DoPT guidelines, rosters are mandatory to maintain for all cadre/category either post to be filled up by promotion or direct recruitment.

Further, the Commission called the reservation rosters maintained for the various category posts in MTNL. The Commission pointed out the following discrepancies as under:

1. The NCSC called the reservation rosters for various category/post for inspection. Accordingly, the MTNL has provided the reservation rosters for the post of Telecom Technical Assistant (under promotion), and the same was checked. During the inspection, it is observed the reservation rosters for various category/posts are not properly maintained as per the DoPT guidelines. The roster should have been prepared in running way which has not been prepared.
2. Some points in the reservation roster has been left blank and they have been filled up at later stage after making of the recruitment of Sc candidate against reserved points which is violation of DoPT guidelines.

3. The reservation rosters should have been prepared as per the post based reservation rosters. The roster should be prepared for the sanctioned strength in each cadre/posts under promotion and Direct Recruitment separately and thereafter replacement should be made. But, the reservation roster has been prepared at whole basis.
4. The SC candidates should have been placed against the points earmarked for SCs and the SCs promoted own merit basis should not have been shown against reserved point. But the MTNL has placed the name of SCs who promoted at later stage and it is not clear whether these vacancies were filled up by own merit basis or reservation point basis. As per their seniority these candidates should have been placed as per their seniority own merit against UR points in the roster and no point should have been left blank.
5. No summery has been made after every recruitment year and there are shortfall of SC vacancies which has not been reported at the time of replying to the questionnaire. Hence, the MTNL is suggested to re-cast the roster and calculate the back-log vacancy alongwith filling up of such vacancies with a proper action plan.

In view of the above, the MTNL management is advised to re-cast the reservation roster for all cadre/category posts separately as per the DoPT guidelines dated 02.09.1997.

The Chairman inquired about the reason of shortfall of four vacancies of JAO cadre. In this regard, the CMD informed that prior to 2003, the recruitments were made by the Deptt. of Telecommunication. The CMD assured that these 04 backlog vacancies will be filled in the year 2015.

The Hon'ble Member Shri Raju Parmar raised the issue regarding non providing of pre-recruitment training to the SC candidates. He suggested that MTNL should explore the possibility of providing pre-recruitment training to the SC candidates in their own training institute so that prospective candidates get familiarized with MTNL jobs. The CMD agreed to the suggestion made and to take necessary steps in this regard.

The Vice-Chairman, NCSC inquired about the SC specific schemes being implementing by the MTNL for the welfare of scheduled castes under CSR activities. In this regard, CMD informed that as such MTNL has no SC specific scheme under CSR. It was suggested that MTNL may enact a SC specific scheme, so that Scheduled Castes could be directly benefited under the CSR activities.

The Commission has also advised to the CMD, MTNL Limited to submit Action Taken Report on the recommendations made during the review meeting by the NCSC within one month positively.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR SCHEDULED CASTES

List of Participants from NCSC

1. Dr. P.L. Punia, Chairman in Chair
2. Dr. Raj Kumar Verka, Vice Chairman,
3. Shri Raju Parmar, Member
4. Shri Ishwar Singh, Member
5. Shri Vinod Aggarwal, Secretary
6. Smt. Smita S. Chaudhary, Joint Secretary
7. Shri Kanhaiya Lal, Director
8. Shri A.P. Gautam, Research Officer

List of Participants from MTNL

1. Shri P.K. Purwar, CMD
2. Sunil Kumar, Director, HR, MTNL
3. Shri Khushi Ram, CVO, MTNL
4. Shri N.K. Joshi, G.M. (HR)/Co.
5. Shri B.K. Mittal, E.D. MTNL, Delhi
6. Smt. Meena Chauna, G.M.(A), MTNL
7. Shri D.N. Mishra, AD-GM(A), MTNL
8. Shri F.R. Tirkey, DGM(HR), MTNL
9. Shri M.K. Saxena, Add. G.M.(P), MTNL

The Representatives of MTNL Ltd. SC/ST Employees Welfare Association.

1. Shri Pardeep Kumar, Gen.Sec., Dr. Ambedkar MTNL SC/ST/OBC EWA
2. Shri Suraj Ranga, Vice-President
3. Smt. Manju Bala, President, MTNL SC/ST EWA
4. Shri K.P. Singh, Gen.Secretary
5. Shri Shishi Pal, Asstt. Gen.Sec. & Circle Secretary
6. Shri B.K. Dohare, Vice-President, South
7. Shri Banshi Lal, Circle Secretary, South